

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

**IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION  
(MDL No. 2406)**

**Master File No. 2:13-CV-20000-RDP**

**This document relates to Provider-  
Track cases.**

**NOTICE OF SEALED FILING REGARDING EVIDENTIARY SUBMISSION IN  
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' MOTION REGARDING THE ANTITRUST  
STANDARD OF REVIEW APPLICABLE TO PROVIDER PLAINTIFFS'  
SECTION 1 CLAIMS PURSUANT TO FEDERAL RULE OF CIVIL  
PROCEDURE 56**

Please take notice that Defendants have filed the following listed documents under seal:

<b>Exhibit</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Bates No.</b>
DX294	Alabama Network Comparison Report (Jan. 2008)	BCBSAL_0000450522
DX295	Alabama Network Comparison Report (Jan. 2008)	BCBSAL_0000450528
DX296	Alabama Network Comparison Report (Jan. 2010)	BCBSAL_0000581921
DX297	Alabama Network Comparison Report (Mar. 2008)	BCBSAL_0000588158
DX299	National Network Comparison Report (Oct. 2011)	BCBSAL_0000748805
DX300	National Network Comparison Report (Dec. 2011)	BCBSAL_0000748838

Dated: June 1, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Evan R. Chesler

Evan R. Chesler

Christine A. Varney

Karin A. DeMasi

Lauren R. Kennedy

David H. Korn

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

Worldwide Plaza

825 Eighth Avenue

New York, NY 10019

Tel: (212) 474-1000

Fax: (212) 474-3700

echesler@cravath.com

cvarney@cravath.com

kdemasi@cravath.com

lkennedy@cravath.com

dkorn@cravath.com

*Coordinating Counsel for Defendant  
Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association;  
Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and  
Blue Shield of Alabama; Blue Cross and  
Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross  
and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.;  
BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee,  
Inc.; CareFirst, Inc.; CareFirst of  
Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization  
and Medical Services, Inc.; CareFirst  
BlueChoice, Inc.; Health Care Service  
Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal  
Reserve Company, including its  
divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue  
Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross  
and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for  
Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and  
Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.*

Craig A. Hoover  
E. Desmond Hogan  
Justin Bernick  
Peter Bisio  
Elizabeth Jose  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
Columbia Square  
555 13th Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 637-5600  
Fax: (202) 637-5910  
craig.hoover@hoganlovells.com  
desmond.hogan@hoganlovells.com  
justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com  
peter.bisio@hoganlovells.com  
elizabeth.jose@hoganlovells.com

John D. Martin  
Lucile H. Cohen  
Travis A. Bustamante  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Tel: (803) 255-9421  
Fax: (803) 256-7500  
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com  
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com  
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Cavender C. Kimble  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203-4642  
Tel: (205) 226-3437  
Fax: (205) 488-5860  
ckimble@balch.com

*Counsel for Anthem, Inc., f/k/a WellPoint, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this consolidated action; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North Carolina, Inc.; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of*

David J. Zott, P.C.  
Daniel E. Laytin, P.C.  
Sarah J. Donnell  
Christa C. Cottrell, P.C.  
Zachary Holmstead  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
300 North LaSalle  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Tel: (312) 862-2000  
Fax: (312) 862-2200  
david.zott@kirkland.com  
daniel.laytin@kirkland.com  
sarah.donnell@kirkland.com  
christa.cottrell@kirkland.com  
zachary.holmstead@kirkland.com

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)  
Mark M. Hogewood  
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &  
BRANDT, LLC  
First Commercial Bank Building  
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400  
Birmingham, AL 35209  
Tel: (205) 870-0555  
Fax: (205) 871-7534  
kwest@wallacejordan.com  
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

*Counsel for Blue Cross Blue Shield Association*

James L. Priester  
Carl S. Burkhalter  
John Thomas A. Malatesta, III  
MAYNARD COOPER & GALE PC  
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 2400  
Regions Harbert Plaza  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 254-1000  
Fax: (205) 254-1999  
jpriester@maynardcooper.com  
cburkhalter@maynardcooper.com  
jmalatesta@maynardcooper.com

Pamela B. Slate

*South Carolina; Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon*

Gwendolyn Payton  
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND &  
STOCKTON LLP  
1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3700  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Tel: (206) 626-7714  
Fax: (206) 299-0414  
gpayton@kilpatricktownsend.com

J. Bentley Owens, III  
ELLIS, HEAD, OWENS & JUSTICE  
113 North Main Street  
Columbiana, AL 35051-0587  
Tel: (205) 669-6783  
Fax: (205) 669-4932  
bowens@wefhlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Premera Blue Cross, d/b/a Premera Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alaska*

Brian K. Norman  
SHAMOUN & NORMAN, LLP  
1800 Valley View Lane, Suite 200  
Farmers Branch, TX 75234  
Tel: (214) 987-1745  
Fax: (214) 521-9033  
bkn@snlegal.com

H. James Koch  
ARMBRECHT JACKSON LLP  
RSA Tower, 27th Floor  
11 North Water Street  
Mobile, AL 36602

HILL CARTER FRANCO COLE &  
BLACK, P.C.

425 South Perry Street  
Montgomery, AL 36104  
Tel: (334) 834-7600  
Fax: (334) 386-4381  
pslate@hillhillcarter.com

*With Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP,  
counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue  
Shield of Alabama*

Helen E. Witt, P.C.  
Jeffrey J. Zeiger, P.C.  
Erica B. Zolner  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
300 North LaSalle  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Tel: (312) 862-2000  
Fax: (312) 862-2200  
hwitt@kirkland.com  
jzeiger@kirkland.com  
ezolner@kirkland.com

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)  
Mark M. Hogewood  
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &  
BRANDT, LLC  
First Commercial Bank Building  
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400  
Birmingham, AL 35209  
Tel: (205) 870-0555  
Fax: (205) 871-7534  
kwest@wallacejordan.com  
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

*Counsel for Defendants Health Care  
Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual  
Legal Reserve Company, including its  
divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue  
Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross  
and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for*

Tel: (251) 405-1300  
Fax: (251) 432-6843  
hjk@ajlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants CareFirst, Inc.;  
CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group  
Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.;  
CareFirst BlueChoice, Inc.*

R. David Kaufman  
M. Patrick McDowell  
BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER  
& HEWES, PLLC  
190 East Capitol Street  
The Pinnacle Building, Suite 100  
Jackson, MS 39201  
Tel: (601) 948-3101  
Fax: (601) 960-6902  
dkaufman@brunini.com  
pmcdowell@brunini.com

John D. Martin  
Lucile H. Cohen  
Travis A. Bustamante  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Tel: (803) 255-9421  
Fax: (803) 256-7500  
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com  
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com  
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Cheri D. Green  
BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD OF  
MISSISSIPPI  
P.O. Box 1043  
Jackson, MS 39215  
Tel: (601) 932-3704  
cdgreen@bcbsms.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue  
Shield of Mississippi, a Mutual Insurance  
Company*

*Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and  
Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark  
Inc., f/k/a Highmark Health Services;  
Highmark West Virginia Inc.; Highmark  
Blue Cross Blue Shield Delaware Inc.;  
California Physicians' Service d/b/a  
Blue Shield of California*

Jonathan M. Redgrave  
REDGRAVE, LLP  
14555 Avion Parkway, Suite 275  
Chantilly, VA 20151  
Tel: (703) 592-1155  
Fax: (612) 332-8915  
jredgrave@redgravellp.com

*Additional Counsel for HCSC and  
Highmark Defendants*

Todd Stenerson  
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP  
401 9th Street, N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 508-8000  
Fax: (202) 508-8100  
todd.stenerson@shearman.com

Sarah L. Cylkowski  
Thomas J. Rheaume, Jr.  
BODMAN PLC  
1901 Saint Antoine Street  
6th Floor at Ford Field  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Tel: (313) 259-7777  
Fax: (734) 930-2494  
scylkowski@bodmanlaw.com  
trheaume@bodmanlaw.com

Andy P. Campbell  
A. Todd Campbell  
Yawanna N. McDonald  
CAMPBELL PARTNERS LLC  
505 North 20th Street, Suite 1600  
Birmingham, AL 35203

Michael A. Naranjo  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
555 California Street, Suite 1700  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Tel: (415) 984-9847  
Fax: (415) 434-4507  
mnaranjo@foley.com

Alan D. Rutenberg  
Benjamin R. Dryden  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
3000 K Street, N.W., Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20007  
Tel: (202) 672-5300  
Fax: (202) 672-5399  
arutenberg@foley.com  
bdryden@foley.com

*Counsel for Defendant US Able Mutual  
Insurance Company, d/b/a Arkansas Blue  
Cross and Blue Shield*

Robert K. Spotswood  
Michael T. Sansbury  
Joshua K. Payne  
Jess R. Nix  
Morgan B. Franz  
SPOTSWOOD SANSOM & SANSBURY  
LLC  
Financial Center  
505 20th Street North, Suite 700  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 986-3620  
Fax: (205) 986-3639  
rks@spotswoodllc.com  
msansbury@spotswoodllc.com  
jpayne@spotswoodllc.com  
jnix@spotswoodllc.com  
mfranz@spotswoodllc.com

*Counsel for Defendant Capital BlueCross*

Tel: (205) 224-0750  
Fax: (205) 224-8622  
andy@campbellpartnerslaw.com  
todd@campbellpartnerslaw.com  
yawanna@campbellpartnerslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross and  
Blue Shield of Michigan*

John Briggs  
Rachel Adcox  
Jeny M. Maier  
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER,  
LLP  
1901 L Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20036  
Tel: (202) 912-4700  
Fax: (202) 912-4701  
jbriggs@axinn.com  
radcox@axinn.com  
jmaier@axinn.com

Stephen A. Rowe  
Aaron G. McLeod  
ADAMS AND REESE LLP  
Regions Harbert Plaza  
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 3000  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 250-5000  
Fax: (205) 250-5034  
steve.rowe@arlaw.com  
aaron.mcleod@arlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Independence  
Blue Cross*

Kathleen Taylor Sooy  
Tracy A. Roman  
Sarah Gilbert  
Honor Costello  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500

Evan R. Chesler  
Christine A. Varney  
Karin A. DeMasi  
Lauren R. Kennedy  
David H. Korn  
CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP  
Worldwide Plaza  
825 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10019  
Tel: (212) 474-1000  
Fax: (212) 474-3700  
echesler@cravath.com  
cvarney@cravath.com  
kdemasi@cravath.com  
lkennedy@cravath.com  
dkorn@cravath.com

John D. Martin  
Lucile H. Cohen  
Travis A. Bustamante  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Tel: (803) 255-9421  
Fax: (803) 256-7500  
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com  
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com  
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

Robert R. Riley, Jr.  
RILEY & JACKSON, P.C.  
3530 Independence Drive  
Birmingham, AL 35209  
Tel: (205) 879-5000  
Fax: (205) 879-5901  
rob@rileyjacksonlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and Blue  
Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue  
Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; BlueCross  
BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.*

Edward S. Bloomberg  
John G. Schmidt

Fax: (202) 628-5116  
ksooy@crowell.com  
troman@crowell.com  
sgilbert@crowell.com  
hcostello@crowell.com

John M. Johnson  
Brian P. Kappel  
LIGHTFOOT FRANKLIN & WHITE  
LLC  
The Clark Building  
400 20th Street North  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 581-0700  
Fax: (205) 581-0799  
jjohnson@lightfootlaw.com  
bkappel@lightfootlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross of  
Idaho Health Service, Inc.; Blue Cross  
and Blue Shield of Kansas, Inc.; Blue  
Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas City;  
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of  
Nebraska; Blue Cross Blue Shield of  
Arizona; Blue Cross Blue Shield of  
North Dakota; Blue Cross Blue Shield  
of Wyoming; Highmark Western and  
Northeastern New York Inc.*

David J. Zott, P.C.  
Daniel E. Laytin, P.C.  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
300 North LaSalle  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Tel: (312) 862-2000  
Fax: (312) 862-2200  
david.zott@kirkland.com  
daniel.laytin@kirkland.com

John Martin  
Lucile H. Cohen  
Travis A. Bustamante  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor



Anna Mercado Clark  
PHILLIPS LYTLE LLP  
One Canalside  
125 Main Street  
Buffalo, NY 14203  
Tel: (716) 847-8400  
Fax: (716) 852-6100  
ebloomberg@phillipslytle.com  
jschmidt@phillipslytle.com  
aclark@phillipslytle.com

Stephen A. Walsh  
WEINBERG, WHEELER, HUDGINS,  
GUNN & DIAL  
100 Corporate Parkway  
One Lake Level  
Birmingham, AL 35242  
Tel: (205) 572-4107  
Fax: (205) 572-4199  
swalsh@wwhgd.com

*Counsel for Defendant, Excellus Health  
Plan, Inc., d/b/a Excellus BlueCross  
BlueShield, incorrectly sued as Excellus  
BlueCross BlueShield of New York*

Columbia, SC 29201  
Tel: (803) 255-9421  
Fax: (803) 256-7500  
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com  
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com  
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

*Counsel for Defendants Wellmark of  
South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue  
Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota);  
Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross  
and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii  
Medical Service Association (Blue  
Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii);  
Triple-S Salud, Inc.*

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)  
Mark M. Hogewood  
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &  
BRANDT, LLC  
First Commercial Bank Building  
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400  
Birmingham, AL 35209  
Tel: (205) 870-0555  
Fax: (205) 871-7534  
kwest@wallacejordan.com  
mhogewood@wallacejordan.com

*Counsel for Defendants Wellmark of  
South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue  
Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota);  
Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross  
and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii  
Medical Service Association (Blue  
Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii)*



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on June 1, 2021, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Evan R. Chesler  
Evan R. Chesler